
A 50% dissertation submitted n partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Master of Art Degree in Cultural and Media Studies

University of Natal

Durban

March 2001
I, Prosper Siboniso Welcome Luthuli, do hereby declare that the work presented in this dissertation is my own. Where use has been made of the work of others, this has been duly acknowledged.

Signed by: ________________________________

Supervised by: Prof. Keyan G. Tomaselli - Director of the Graduate Programme in Cultural and Media Studies, University of Natal (Durban).
ABSTRACT

In its report titled *News in Black and White: An Investigation Into Racial Stereotyping in the Media* (1999), one of several reports published by the South African Human Rights Commission (SAHRC) during the course of its recent inquiry into issues of racism in this country’s media, the Media Monitoring Project (MMP) purports to have used discourse analysis (DA) and content analysis (CA) alongside each other in order to carry out its part of the mentioned inquiry. Paradoxically, however, a careful examination of its report raises questions not only about this media monitoring agency’s conception and application of discourse analysis, but also about the understanding of this method of inquiry by some of the media scholars and practitioners who evaluated various reports that resulted from the SAHRC Inquiry. With regards to the latter, for instance, some scholars have variously identified the methods of research used by MMP and the independent researcher, Claudia Braude, (even to the extent of negating the claims of these researchers) during the media inquiry.

Using the MMP report cited above as a primary text or point of reference, this dissertation attempts to critically examine the basis and validity of the perceptions alluded to in the foregoing. In particular, it addresses itself to two different, and yet related questions. Firstly, did MMP misconceive and misapply discourse analysis, as some media scholars have argued? In other words, do these criticisms have a sound basis and validity? Secondly, do differences in the manner in which some media scholars have characterised or identified the respective methods of research used by Braude and MMP, suggest a lack of a clear understanding of these methods on the part of MMP and these scholars? Chapter One, begins with an attempt to define the problem to which the study pertains, and offers an account on the following aspects: a brief background to the study; its aims, relevance, and significance; the theoretical framework and the methods and methodology on which it is based; and the structure thereof. Chapter Two defines and maps out the scope of discourse analysis against the backdrop of content analysis, a research technique that some scholars see the former (DA) as an alternative to. Chapter Two further provides an exposition on various insights on content analysis and discourse
how these methods are generally applied in practical
situations, using these as a benchmark against which to critique
the MMP report in Chapter Three. Chapter Three, which forms the body of the study,
offers a critique of MMP’s conception and application of discourse analysis. A summary
of the findings of the study is offered in Chapter Four, and these are followed by a
synoptic account of the concluding remarks in Chapter Five.
I would like to express my sincere thanks to my supervisor, Prof. Keyan Tomaselli of the Graduate Programme in Cultural and Media Studies, University of Natal, without whose expert guidance and critical acumen this dissertation would not have been possible. I also wish to express my personal gratitude to several individuals for their assistance and encouragement during excruciatingly hard times in which this project has been undertaken: my beloved brother, Edward Vusumuzi Luthuli; my astonishingly altruistic brother-in-law, Emmanuel Nathi Mavundla; and my dependable friends Sisi Sibongile Ngcobo and Xolani Dubazane. All of you have made me understand and appreciate the sustenance that true brotherhood, sisterhood, and friendship can bring to a person’s life. My deep and heartfelt appreciation goes to my family (especially my mother) for the unstinting support and encouragement that you have given me throughout my academic career. To my late mother in particular, I say “Siyadela isambane, esimba umgodini singawuhlali, senzela onkomankoma nawungungumbane! Ū = ŪThe ant-bear is a Happy fellow, who digs a hole and then doesn’t live in it making it only for ferns and porcupines.” The assistance and co-operation of William Bird, the head of the Media Monitoring Project’s operations during the SAHRC Inquiry, is also highly appreciated.

The financial assistance (in the form of a graduate award) of the Graduate School of Human Sciences at the University of Natal, Durban, is also acknowledged. However, the views that are expressed in this study, should not be seen to be representing those of the School in question.
Problem statement
Background to the study
Aims, relevance, and significance of the study
Theoretical framework
Methods of research and methodology
Structure of the study

Chapter Two: Defining and doing content analysis and discourse analysis ------20-56

What is content analysis?
A resume of the history and development of content analysis
Defining content analysis
Doing content analysis: A practical guide
Design
Execution
Writing a research report of content analysis
What is discourse analysis?
A résumé of the history and development of discourse analysis
Chomsky’s generative grammar
Defining discourse analysis
The notion of context in discourse analysis
Critical discourse analysis
Doing discourse analysis Δ An example from Teun van Dijk’s cognitive model of DA
The complimentary nature of content analysis and discourse analysis
Conclusion

Chapter Three: The Media Monitoring Project’s Report: A Critique---------57-104
Part One: The presentation of the MMP report vis-à-vis discourse analysis
LIST OF ACRONYMS USED

ABASA
Association of Black Accountants of South Africa

BLA
Black Lawyers Association

CA
Content Analysis

CDA
Critical Discourse Analysis

COM
Campaign for Open Media

COMTASK
Task Group on Government Communication

DA
Discourse Analysis

MMP
Media Monitoring Project

PA
Propositional Analysis

SAHRC
South African Human Rights Commission

TA
Textual Analysis

TRC
Truth and Reconciliation Commission

TODA
Text-Oriented Discourse Analysis