



*Your complimentary  
use period has ended.  
Thank you for using  
PDF Complete.*

1

[Click Here to upgrade to  
Unlimited Pages and Expanded Features](#)

## **Bushman Identity as Shifting and Incomplete: A response to cultural tourism**

Anthea Simoes  
Graduate Programme in Cultural and Media Studies  
University of Natal, Durban

Fax: 031-260-1510  
Phone: 031-260-1518

### **Acknowledgements**

This project is part of a larger study on cultural tourism being conducted by Professor Keyan G Tomaselli, which incorporates the San and KwaZulu-Natal indigenous communities. The project is funded by the Natal University Research Fund. For further information see Tomaselli (1999a).

June 1999

Identity and Cultural Studies: Is That All There Is?ö  
Hallø's distinction between two different öhistorical  
and strategic models of identity (1996: 89). The first emphasizes the existence of single  
and separate identities and the second emphasizes the existence of a multiplicity of  
identities, where identity is interpreted as incomplete and relational. In examining the  
Bushmen<sup>1</sup> of Southern Africa, it becomes clear that their identity is contested and is  
unstable. Grossbergø's second model is therefore applicable. The specific issues of the  
construction of identity through discursive practices of representation, the dependency of  
identity formation on temporal and spatial concerns, on language and on narratives of the  
body, as well as the modern South African context of identity and intercultural exchange,  
will be discussed in relation to the Bushman identity. The focus of this analysis is largely  
based on the manifestation of Bushman identity in the realm of cultural tourism. The  
empirical evidence that is evaluated in the discussion relates to a Kalahari Bushmen family,  
the Kruipers, who are living on the Kagga Kamma Private Game Reserve in the Western  
Cape, South Africa. (The research team who went to the reserve was headed by Professor  
Keyan Tomaselli of the Graduate Programme of Cultural and Media Studies, Merrideth,  
his niece from Australia, Jeffrey Sehume, a PhD student at the Centre and myself.)

---

<sup>1</sup> There is much controversy over the naming of these people. In this essay, I will refer to them as 'Bushmen' as this is how they were identified at Kagga Kamma. The name 'San' is used, however, when appropriate to particular texts.

strategic transition from the first to the second model of identity, is largely explained by the de-centring of the Enlightenment subject which is analysed in Stuart Hall's 'The Question of Cultural Identity'. Modernity viewed the human subject to be both indivisible and unique. In late-modernity, however, the subject came to be understood as both estranged and dislocated. Evidently, this coincides with a rejection of the possibility of 'one fully constituted, separate and distinct identity' (Grossberg 1996: 89). Hall (1994: 119- 125) lists five main movements which contributed to this de-centring of the subject. Marxism is the first de-centring movement. In Marxist theory, the subject is established as having agency, but this is qualified by the assertion that individuals make decisions on the 'basis of conditions which are not of their own making' (in Hall 1994: 120).

Louis Althusser, is also interpreted as having negated the notion of a universal essence of Man. Sigmund Freud and later, Jacques Lacan's elaboration of the unconscious and symbolic processes by which a human's identity is formed through the look of the Other, constitutes the second movement. This particular psycho-analytic theory contributed to an understanding of identification as a process which does not designate the fullness of identity but rather 'a lack of wholeness which is 'filled' from outside us' (Hall 1994: 122).

The French linguist, Ferdinand de Saussure's avocation that the subject is not the author of language but is rather spoken by it, is cited as the third de-centring. Jacques Derrida expanded on this theory, declaring that the subject has no control over meaning. The fourth de-centring occurs with the work of Foucault. He advocated that disciplinary powers in society regulate the individual and the collective group, producing what he referred to as the 'docile body'. Michel Foucault asserted that in the context of late-modernity, the more collective and organised the institutions, the more isolated the individual. Feminism as the final critique and social movement which challenged the unity and centrality of the subject bringing into question the various ways in which subjectivity is formed.

## 'Identity'

has been deconstructed by various disciplines, all of which challenge the idea of an integral, originary and unified identity, implicit in the first model (Hall 1990: 1). This method of deconstruction indicates that the term is no longer really 'serviceable' because of its previous associations, but that no new term has yet taken its place. It still exists as a key concept because of its 'centrality to the question of agency and politics' (Hall 1996: 2). Hall specifies that identity is significant for modern political movements in its unstable form and in terms of its relationship to a politics of location. He also clarifies that the question of agency should be defined in terms of the articulated relationship between the subject and discursive practices. (He is largely influenced by Foucault in this regard.) It should be acknowledged that Hall does not only name discourse in the constitution of identity, but also the psyche. Here, Freud and Lacan's theories of identification are relevant. However, in the context of this study, this line of thought will not be investigated. It is the outward, social factors in the constitution of the Bushman identity which are both observable and relevant. The construction of the subject through discourse is a point that will be returned to shortly.

### **Identity in terms of a temporal logic**

Stuart Hall's (1997) musings in 'Random Thoughts Provoked by the Conference 'Identities, Democracy, Culture and Communications in Southern Africa', held in Durban at the University of Natal, provide an indication of the kinds of assumptions implicit in the more recent, second model of identity as opposed to the first. Cultural identity is not viewed as a static definition of a particular common origin or common experience. Rather, culture is impermanent and creates a certain tension within the individual between 'roots' and 'routes' (Hall 1997: 4). Identity is understood in terms of a logic of temporality and is formed by a combination of the context of recognition from which one comes and 'the different staging posts' that one goes through, collectively and individually (Hall 1997: 4). Further on in the article, Hall defines identity as being a combination of 'different histories. Those different ways in which at different moments people have addressed us, have called us and the recognitions this implies' (1997: 11). The implication is that the identity of the individual can never be regarded as complete. It is always in the process of being moulded through time as different points of recognition

This sense of process in the formulation of identity is re-iterated in 'Introduction: Who Needs Identity?' Here, Hall defines identity as being less about an historical origin and more about the process of combining historical resources, culture and language in the production of an identity. In a modern context, identity can no longer be regarded as unitary or singular, but rather 'fragmented and fractured' (Hall 1996: 4). Identities are: multiply constructed across different, often intersecting and antagonistic, discourses, practices and positions. They are subject to a radical historicization, and are constantly in the process of change and transformation (Hall 1996: 4).

The notion of a unitary and singular cultural identity based on a particular historical origin (which forms the basis of the first model of identity) finds its correspondence in the persistence of certain myths about the Bushmen of Southern Africa. Kaitira Kandjii, who took part in a field trip to Eastern Bushmanland, illustrates the gulf that exists between the 'dominant images of Bushman [which] show them wearing skins, hunting, gathering and living in a 'primitive' way' and their actual, more modern way of life whereby they practice subsistence farming and depend largely on tourism for their income (Kandjii 1996: 4). Perhaps the most significant indicator of the gap between the myth of the Bushmen as a primitive, authentic and 'untouched' people is the case of N!Xau, the main Bushman actor in the comedy *The Gods Must Be Crazy*, which propagates romantic myths about the Bushmen. He lives in a permanent, five-bedroom house, keeps cattle and wears western, store-bought clothing.

There is obviously a discrepancy between the static model of identity based on historical origin and the more appropriate, flexible model of identity which combines history with new points of recognition. This discrepancy in the identity of the Bushmen is evident in a two page notice entitled, *Bushmen... Their changing way of life* which was pinned up in a display area in the bar-lounge of the Kagga Kamma Private Game Reserve. (Kagga Kamma is a game reserve which offers the experience of meeting with members of the Kruiper family, a Kalahari Bushman group which was offered residence on the reserve in

described in the text, coincides with the simplistic and emphasise a distinct, authentic Bushman culture. The myth represents the Bushmen as a people living a happy, carefree existence in harmony with nature and far from the stresses of cities and civilisation. The potential infantilism and reductionism of this simplistic, first model of cultural identity is evident in the presentation of the Bushmen as:

... a people who history has passed by, a people preserving the lost innocence of humankind, childlike, yet profound, simple, yet subtly attuned to the animals around them and to the changing face of the desert (Anon. nd, circa 1998: 1).

As this notice suggests, these Western romantic ideals negate the existence of real people struggling with real problems. But more than this, I would argue that such a view of the Bushmen as cultural isolates also serves to negate the existence of a cultural identity that is in actual fact in process (Tomaselli 1999a). The development from one understanding of their cultural identity as fully constituted (Grossberg 1996: 89) and based on a particular historical origin, to a more flexible understanding of their identity as incomplete, including both a sense of origin, but also new meanings, is indicative itself of the relationship of identity to a logic of temporality.

It might even be possible to argue that the Bushmen themselves identify most with a particular historical construction of their cultural identity which corresponds to the first model. This is best reflected by the manner in which the Bushmen choose to interact with the outside world. In an interview with Danie Jacobs, a Kagga Kamma guide, he stated that they do know about certain Western technological devices such as television, radios and personal computers, but choose not to use them. The Kruiper family have appeared in a number of films and advertisements such as Red Scorpion, Kalahari Harry and the Vodacom television advertisements. When asked if these films present a romantic image of the Bushmen, Jacobs responded in the negative and said that the Bushmen respond in their own traditional way. They are proud of who they are and they want to share this with others. During one of the tourist visits to the Bushmen, one of the Bushmen told Professor Tomaselli that they actually preferred not to wear the blankets and were only

When someone wished to take a picture of them to the traditional bone pipes, they refused. From these encounters, it is obvious that they wish to be perceived by the outside world as traditional and possessing an uncontaminated insular culture.

In introducing his study, *Between Tourism and Ethnography: A Postmodern Tour Guide in Bali*, Edward Bruner describes the quest of millions of temporary travellers from the industrialised nations to find in the margins of the Third World a figment of their imagination, a fantasy of Western consciousness- the exotic, erotic, primitive, the happy savage (Bruner nd: 29). Bruner states that this romantic characterisation of the vanishing primitive, the pastoral allegory, the quest for origins suppresses the real conditions of life but also creates an illusion of a life which never really existed (Bruner nd: 30). An single Argentinean tourist, a cattle rancher, who was a self-proclaimed voyager, demonstrated this desire (debilitating for the Bushmen) to access the culture of the vanishing primitive (Bruner nd: 30) when he stated that the Bushmen would be happier if we left them to live in their natural way. A Swiss couple visiting Kagga Kamma declared that they had wanted to go to the Kalahari to see the real Bushmen or, in other words, the traditional or primitive Bushmen who still live solely off the land.<sup>2</sup> Such Bushmen only constitute a small percentage of the total Bushmen population in existence today. Yet by these standards, the majority of Bushmen are denied their Bushmen identity. The Kruipers who live at Kagga Kamma are evidence of a people who do still see themselves as Bushmen, but the definition of this identity is by no means fixed according to their classification as the remnants of a Stone Age culture that goes back untold generations (The Natal Witness 1999: 19). The Kruipers make their living through cultural tourism in a cash economy. They live in brick houses and buy the majority of their food in the nearby shop. When they meet the tourists, they are sitting around the fire, wrapped in blankets in winter and using Swiss Army knives to make the

---

<sup>2</sup> Human responses are however never clear cut, especially in the context of identity. This same Swiss couple, cited later, expressed their reservations about invading the privacy of the Bushmen which contrasts with the kind of consciousness of Westerners in search of the primitive, essential, First Peoples. There was therefore a certain ambivalence in their attitude to the Kruiper family as objects of their tourist gaze.

. By their own insistence, their children are being  
ern and Bushmen skills in a school in the Kalahari.

From this simplistic study of the Bushmen lifestyle, it is evident that there can be no simple cultural deductions made about the Kruipers with regards to their identity. The instability of the Bushmen identity is perhaps best illustrated by the symbolic juxtaposition of the photographs in the Kagga Kamma album of the family getting into vehicles at the reserve to go and register for South Africa's first democratic elections, wearing Western clothes and of Dawid Kruiper (the leader of the group) being interviewed by journalists on election day, semi-clad in his traditional attire. (Bhabha's description of a "partial culture" representing the "contaminated yet connective tissue between cultures" seems appropriate (1996: 54).) The evidence of their traditional costume and the juxtaposed photographs would seem to appear on opposite sides of the spectrum in a description of Bushmen identity. But it seems that temporally, there is a constant sliding between such notions (which correspond with the two models), indicating the incompleteness of their identity.

### **The discursive approach to identity**

Identification over identity is "the moment when we invest in how we are hailed from the outside" (Hall 1997: 12). Hall declares that in common language, identification involves recognising a common characteristic with another individual or group and the feeling of solidarity and allegiance that is thereby naturally formed. It is the "naturalism" of this understanding of identification which is contested by the discursive approach (that is favoured by the second model). In the discursive approach, identity is viewed as constructed by various discursive practices. This in turn means that identity is conditional and historically determined by different relations of power. It is understood to be a "process [which] operates across difference, it entails discursive work, the binding and marking of symbolic boundaries" (Hall 1996: 3). "The concept deployed here is therefore not an essentialist, but a strategic and positional one" (Hall 1996: 3).

from 'production' or rather, 'construction' of identity. Identification is not regarded in this context, as the result of a 'natural and inevitable or primordial totality' but of a 'constructed form of closure' (Hall 1996: 5). Identity is seen to be produced through various discursive formations and practices which inevitably entails the play of power. In *The Penguin Dictionary of Sociology*, discourse is described as 'a ready-made way of thinking, [which] can rule out alternatives of thinking and hence preserve a particular distribution of power' (1984, 1988: 70). Identities are seen to be constructed through difference and exclusion. Hall refers to Butler's assertion that

all identities operate through exclusion, through the discursive construction of a constitutive outside and the production of abjected and marginalized subjects, apparently outside the field of the symbolic, the representable (in 1996:15).

The particular discursive practice which I would like to privilege in this study is that of the representation of the Bushmen to the tourists in the written and oral texts which frame the Kruiper family. Various subject positions are constructed through representation which interpellate the Bushmen. (Of course, it is not assumed that they will in fact identify with the position, as Hall's theory of identification suggests. But discourse does produce the circumstances in which their identity is to be understood.) The contradictions in the representations of Bushmen are clear and have already been alluded to in the discussion of the 'Great Bushmen Myth'. The 'paradoxes' are indicative of the complex nature of their identity and how representations of it have changed historically.

Historically, the Bushmen myths which coincide with the first model of identity, fit into that discourse which signifies racial 'difference' and entails processes of naturalization (which attempt to fix cultural identities), as well as reductionism and stereotyping, whereby cultures of the 'Other' are reduced to their essences. The discourse sought to maintain a particular social and symbolic order which excluded those groups who were deemed different and of course, historically, served as a justification for colonisation and domination. In more recent history, the operation of power relations within identity

ificance in South Africa where segregation was

awhall states that:

The Nama and San people know that the suppression of their identities and languages was required to assert the ideology of apartheid and justify the seizure of land (1998: 27).

In the travel brochure for Kagga Kamma, the Kruipers are framed in a particular manner which appears to fix and essentialize Bushmen. The lyrical text on the final page names all the traditional qualities of Bushmen life as associated with the 'Great Bushmen Myth'—those of a unity with nature and with their ancestral spirits, their skills of living off the land and those human qualities of being wise and cunning. There is a definite focus on their history as constituting their identity with the words 'almost extinct from our ancient history' and 'leave with memories of a people as old as mankind itself.' This kind of discourse fits in more with the first model of identity and with the historic discourse signifying essential racial differences. It contrasts with the information displayed in the bar (already discussed) which concludes on the note, 'Eden, if it ever existed, has gone; poverty and a need to struggle for their rights have swiftly taken place' (Anon. nd, circa 1998: 2).

The introductory lecture to Kagga Kamma tourists, given by Danie Jacobs, the tour guide who is studying to be an anthropologist, is an example of a discourse which also challenges the essentialist, romantic discourse that often frames the Bushmen in films such as *The Gods Must Be Crazy*. Jacobs gives an historical analysis of the Bushmen and their 'ancient culture' and way of life, a modern analysis of their changing status and lifestyles, as well as details about the Kruiper family itself.

Jacobs emphasises the complexity of Bushmen religion and the ingenuity of their lifestyles.

This contests the discourses born in colonial times, used by both Bantu and Westerners, which represented the Bushmen as sub-human and which today represents them as infantile and helpless. He humorously counters the Western fantastic pursuit for an original and authentic culture of the First Peoples, by stating that one cannot bring back the ancient Bushmen culture as this would effectively entail the impossible task of all those

Europe and transporting themselves in ox wagons. He criticises the British at the horrors of colonialism and asserts that treating the Bushmen as if they are people in wheel chairs will only result in dependency. He mentions that there have been Bushmen in Southern Africa who we have simply not known how to recognise because of their inter-marriage with other cultural groups. This is an interesting reference to the possibility of a hybrid cultural identity.

The common myth that Bushmen are only defined as those who still live in a traditional manner is dispelled by the statement that "It doesn't mean that if they do not have a loin cloth then they are not a Bushman." He explains how it is only natural for the Bushmen to appropriate those elements of modern life, for example matches, which make their lives easier. They are still Bushmen in their hearts. Although some of the ideas presented in Jacobs's lecture might be sentimental or simplistic, the lecture does create a new understanding of the Bushmen and their identity, which is changing according to the new ways that they are represented, but also according to the adaptations in their lives as a result of contact and exchange with the Western world. It can thus be seen that the representation of the Bushmen to the tourists at Kagga Kamma is varied and multiple.

### **Identity in terms of a logic of spatiality**

The logic of temporality can be replaced in the cultural study of identity, which emphasises the acquisition of new identities through time, with one of spatiality (Grossberg 1996:100). Grossberg states that "subjectivity as spatial ... involves taking literally the statement that people experience the world from a particular position." The notion of identity construction through spatiality becomes particularly relevant in the discussion of the Bushmen situation. In his lecture, Jacobs states that the identity of the Bushmen (between different clans) is dependent on their common religion and lifestyle. He went on to say that "[t]hey lived so closely to nature that this [the natural environment] that you see in front of you became their bible; and over time we 'took their visualised bible away.'" The Bushmen were people who "...lived off the land... thousands of years...[They] did not buy the Kalahari. God gave it to [them]" (in Crawhall 1998: 26). The issue of the land rights of the Bushmen and the connection of their cultural identity

in the recent South African context of the 1994  
h aims at restoring land that was displaced as a result  
of racially biased laws. It is limited, however, to the period after the Native Land Act of  
1913 effectively excluding most Khoe and San people who lost their land rights prior to  
this. In the case of the Kruiper family, the article *Waiting for a slice of heaven on earth*  
demonstrates the importance of land to their sense of identity. Dawid Kruiper is quoted as  
stating, *I have lived in darkness... Getting the land will allow me to stand up and say to  
the world: Here is Dawid Kruiper and here are my people* (Natal Witness, 17 March,  
1999: 19).

The Kruiper family have subsequently (in 1999) received a piece of land from the  
government and most of the family, including Dawid, have moved back to the Kalahari.  
There were only two women and two babies and about six or seven men located at Kagga  
Kamma in May 1999, from an earlier high of forty, although there is apparently a fair  
amount of movement between the Kalahari and the reserve. The men who have remained  
are jokingly referred to by the guide as the *bachelors*. They seem to act as the *bread-*  
*winner* for the rest of the family by selling their craft to the tourists at Kagga Kamma.  
Jeffrey Sehume suggested the interesting term of *migratory labourers* with regards to  
these men. Bhabha quotes Eliot, that in the context of migration,

The people have taken with them only a part of the total culture... The culture which  
develops on the new soil must therefore be bafflingly alike and different from the parent  
culture (1996: 94).

This *culture of migration* which combines elements of the old parent culture and the  
new, takes on a very material form in the context of the Kruipers. Although the Karoo  
area was inhabited by their ancestors (evident by the presence of Bushmen rock paintings  
on the game reserve), this is a new environment for these Kalahari Bushmen and adapting  
to the weather and the new terrain is not easy. Munnik's article *Bushmen in the Fynbos*,  
documents the Kruipers' complaints about the cold weather and the fact that *the fynbos*  
is not much of a hunting ground and *you also cannot gather much food from the fynbos*  
(1992: 3). During our fieldwork at Kagga Kamma, Jacobs explained that they are still

have to import some of the materials for their  
for their arrows from the Kalahari.

## Language

To the importance of temporality, representation and spatial location in identity formation, can be added the category of language. Benedict Anderson's chapter entitled 'The Origins of National Consciousness', illustrates how the combination of the capitalist development of print and the 'fatal diversity of language created the possibility of a new form of imagined community' (1983: 49). He also attributes to national identity both its historical embeddedness and language. 'Seen as both a historical fatality and as a community imagined through language, the nation presents itself as simultaneously open and closed' (1983: 133). All the surviving Khoi and San languages are in fact at risk of imminent extinction and the people are very anxious about it. The Kruiper family speak a mixture of Afrikaans and Nama. The children of the Kruiper family are attending a school in the Kalahari where they are being taught the original Bushmen language, Khomani. The importance of this to a project of identity construction is evident in Anderson's closing (if somewhat sentimental) comment, 'Through that language, encountered at mother's knee and parted with only at the grave, pasts are restored, fellowships are imagined, and futures dreamed' (1983: 140).

Hope has however been stirred by the government's inclusion of a clause in Article 6 of the Constitution which encourages the protection and development of the Khoi, Nama and San languages. It should be borne in mind, however, that South Africa still operates within an apartheid conception of identity whereby there is the creation of :

a mythological original and authentic status for the dominant 'Black' African 'Nguni-Sotho' elite which is contrasted with other less authentic identities: white, coloured and Asian (Crawhall 1998: 29).

Bushmen cultural identity, which in Crawhall's article is seen to be dependent on issues of language and land, is unfortunately subsumed into the broad and 'less authentic' (Crawhall 1998: 29) category of 'coloureds'. But Crawhall suggests that investigation of

and identities in Southern Africa could provide the new  
for nation-building. This view coincides with  
Ntongela Mashieles's emphasis on San culture as being the common South African cultural  
heritage that can serve to breakdown and unify the various competing nationalisms in this  
country (Tomaselli 1995: vii).

### **Narratives of the body**

An interesting study by Steven Robins reveals the interplay of memorialisation and  
narratives of the body in the construction of identity, particularly national identity. (His  
study incorporates the role of history - a reference to temporality in identity formation -  
and identity construction in the South African context.) He explains how the human body  
is seen in its social dimension and becomes a nationalist metaphor. Personal and collective  
memory is shown to be unstable and the fragments and silences in personal accounts of  
history are seen in relation to the totalizing historical narratives which may or may not  
represent the potential multiple voices.

Robins critiques Hobsbawm and Ranger's assertion that the recent public performances of  
Nama identity for claims to traditional lands are merely examples of 'invented tradition'  
or 'staged authenticity' (Robins 1988: 128). Robins argues that these are not fictional  
public performances but acts to reclaim social memory which is severely fragmented by  
colonial and subsequently apartheid encounters. (The effect of apartheid's Church and  
school system, for example, on the dissipation of Nama tradition and languages has  
already been mentioned, in terms of the operation of power relations in the construction of  
identity. This is an example of what Gramsci would refer to as the operation of  
ideological institutions in the civil society which aim to preserve the dominance of the  
hegemonic class.) There has been an attempt in recent years of KhoiSan activists to  
construct 'totalizing ethnic-nationalist narratives that draw upon collective memories of  
suffering' (Robins 1998: 131).

In spite of mixed ancestry, there has been an attempt to claim biological and cultural  
continuity to pre-colonial KhoiSan ancestors such as Saartje Baartman. The case of Ms

to have her bodily remains returned to Africa for burial, complex links between the corporeal body and the body politic. The symbolic appropriation of this female body, as well as the discussions which were inspired by the *Miscast* exhibition in Cape Town indicate how the *Bushman body* has become a key site of contestation and commentary on memory and identity. (Robins 1998: 136)

The pristine displays of Bushmen in the South African Museum were challenged at the exhibition by the display of charts and instruments which were used to classify KhoiSan bodies. The colonial measurement of the KhoiSan body is similar to the kinds of technologies used by the Nazi racial studies. Both are indications of a Western mentality obsessed with the exclusion and elimination of the Other. Historically, the body became the focus for the discourse of racial theory which entailed the Culture/ Nature distinction. The physical human body was used as the embodiment and proof of racial difference:

In the attempt to trace the line of determination between the biological and the social, the body became the totemic object, and its very visibility the evident articulation of nature and culture (in *Hall 1997: 244*)

The *Miscast* exhibition provided a public space in which memory could be accessed and the multiplicity of views on what it means to be KhoiSan, could be played out. There were for example, many different reactions to the arrival of the *half-clad* clan of Bushmen from Kagga Kamma. A representative of the Brown Movement criticised what was interpreted as the *objectification of the bodies of the Brown people* (in Robins 1998: 143). The *Hurikamma Cultural Movement* stated that it was as if they were *acting out the sick dramas* of the colonial past (in Robins 1998: 135). Mahongo, a minister who represented the *!Xu San*, called for the naked bodies of the Kagga Kamma Bushmen to be covered. His request is reminiscent of the attempt of early missionaries in the Cape who *sought to transform the naked body through the civilising cover of clothing* (Robins 1998: 135).

The public forum of the *Miscast* exhibition revealed issues of how

odies were appropriated and recruited to produce  
multi-nationalist identities and ideologies, and  
essentialist narratives of biological and cultural continuity (Robins 1998: 137).

Narratives of suffering in the colonial past are used as unifying narratives of national destiny. This indicates a distortion in the process of identity construction, of what Hall (1997: 4) distinguishes as a contributor to identity, historical origin or 'roots'. Robins warns against such totalizing nationalist narratives. It is concerning if the nationalist drive becomes obsessed with a single construction of identity which excludes possibilities of a hybrid community wherein the histories of different ethnic groups are intertwined. Robins's closing remarks raise similar issues to those of Crawhall (1998: 26-30). He questions who has the right or privilege in South Africa to have their voices heard, to have the opportunity to contribute to the collective memory of 'black experience'.

which do not reflect the kind of intercultural exchanges characteristic of the present era, is challenged by Michael Chapman in his attempt at providing a method of cultural analysis appropriate for South Africa in the global neighbourhood. He warns against the indiscriminate use of a 'postcolonial' method of analysis in the multi-faceted context of South Africa, where Appiah distinguishes 'ethical humanism' (1997: 20) as the key African consideration and where the 'West and Africa enrich and contaminate each other at levels more profound than styles of aesthetic representation' (1997: 21). Chapman does describe South Africa's re-entry into the world as being in the context not only of 'unprecedented global unity' but also 'unprecedented local fragmentation'. The multiplicity and diversity of the present context is evident in his statement that:

'[w]hereas pre-global times were characterized by oppositions, global times are about proliferations; instead of unitary systems we have diverse modalities and rapid mobilities' (Chapman 1997: 21).

He specifies though that in the light of South Africa's divided past, a postmodernist critique of totality might not actually be relevant. (This corresponds with Robins's concern for totalizing nationalist narratives (1998: 120- 140).) Nixon is referred to as saying that 'the language of multiplicity has in South Africa been the language of false endings' (in Chapman 1997: 24). In this vein, Chapman highlights the importance of not casting secure and single definitions of identity. '[O]ur differentiated modernity, our hybrid condition, should ensure that we resist splitting our story into that of Africa and the West' (Chapman 1997: 24). He uses the analogy of shared story telling to illustrate the impossibility of limiting a discussion of South Africa into the binary oppositions of 'African integrity' and 'Western internationalism'. Investigation into the oral tradition reveals that 'oral man is both traditional and modern, both communally oriented and individualistically inspired' (Chapman 1997: 21). He states that historically, Bushman and Bantu-speakers cannot be regarded simplistically as others or essences.

Judging by Chapman's discussion and, of course, by common knowledge, the impact of globalisation on the 'insularity' of individual ethnic and national cultural identities is a given. Bhabha states, 'The fatality of thinking of 'local' cultures as uncontaminated or

In the case of the Bushmen at Kagga Kamma, the most obvious scenario for intercultural exchange is the context of the meeting between the visiting tourists and the Kruipers. This meeting is mediated by Jacobs. Jacobs's position as an expert in the field (as a student anthropologist) is important as a marketing ploy. He is a "built-in authenticator" who acts as a "validation" that the tourists are "in the presence of those who know the 'real' Bushmen (Bruner nd: 6). As an extension of this role as the expert, the preparatory lecture (which has already been discussed), is important in terms of establishing his authority in the subject. A Swiss couple, interviewed at Kagga Kamma by Professor Tomaselli, expressed their discomfort at invading the "private activity" of the Bushmen in their first visit and their disappointment at the fact that there seemed to be "no feelings" between Bushmen and guide. This disillusionment and isolation from the Bushmen was also experienced by Peter, a European immigrant. He and his South African wife, Harriet, said that they were dissatisfied by the amount that they had learned about the Bushmen and complained that their questions had not been answered. Both of these couples were relating experiences of tours that were guided by Daan, a conservationist who temporarily filled in for Jacobs and was not qualified in any way to be teaching about the Bushmen. The importance of the qualifications of the guide to the tourists' appreciation of their Bushmen "experience" is therefore obvious.

After receiving the introductory lecture, the tourists are driven to the enclosure which is the designated meeting place with the tourists. (In the early days of the Bushmen residence on Kagga Kamma, tourists visited the Kruiper's actual residence. This system was modified to preserve the family's privacy.) Jacobs symbolically introduces the tour group to the Bushmen through a show of hands to indicate which tourists come from which country. Tourists are also instructed to wait until he has symbolically asked permission before they begin to take photographs. He then continues to give a lecture on Bushmen in the enclosure.

to interact freely with the Bushmen, this interaction  
there were the most visitors present, communication  
only occurred between tourists when they wished to have photographs taken with the  
Bushmen baby or when they were buying goods from the shop at the back of the  
enclosure. Professor Tomaselli's discussions in Afrikaans with the Kruipers, or my sitting  
at the fire between them, inquiring about their smoking habits, were not the norm.

There is a variety of possible explanations for this lack of interchange between the  
Bushmen and the tourists. The first and most obvious possibility is the difficulty of  
language barriers. This concern about language was also mentioned by Peter and Harriet.  
It was suggested that a Bushman guide and a Western translator could be a more  
empowering and informative solution. (There apparently used to be a Bushman guide that  
accompanied the Ranger, but he was now semi-retired.) Jacobs could, however, translate  
and no interaction was established between the other tourists and the Bushmen.

In his study of tourism in Bali, Bruner (nd: 8) explains this distance between what he  
refers to as the "tourist subject" and the "native object" as vital to the operation of  
modern mass tourism. The maintenance of separation is related to the fact that "fantasy  
only operates at a distance" (nd: 8). From the perspective of the "object," the Bushmen  
possibly wish to maintain their sense of privacy, as far as possible. Their names, for  
example, are not readily given which may be a way of keeping their working lives separate  
from their private lives. Bruner counters the operation of fantasy with the importance of  
recognising real identities. He quotes Clifford,

It is more than ever crucial for different peoples to form complex concrete images of  
one another, as well as of the relationships of knowledge and power that connect them  
(Bruner nd: 9).

This is fitting to Bruner's avocation of a more postmodern style of tourism whereby the  
tourists are made aware of the mechanisms of tourist production and intercultural  
exchange is encouraged.

at interaction between the tourists and the San, as she  
1, involves a meeting of two sets of stereotypes and  
myths that each group has of the other. There is no real understanding of each group's life  
experiences, perceptions and understanding of the world. For example, a tourist might  
interpret living conditions in Eastern Bushmanland as being in some way primordial,  
essential and close to nature and the environment. The Bushmen, on the other hand are  
resentful of their own poverty and desire education and improved living standards, but  
more by Western standards. The nature of the exchange between the two cultures, does  
not, in Jeusen's view, "allow for the breaking down of stereotypes or the banishing of  
myths." (1997: 14)

Tomaselli also comments on this notion of a meeting of stereotypes between the tourists and  
the locals. Discourses, such as those found in The Gods Must be Crazy, interpellate the San  
"as the primordial object of the tourists' gaze" (Tomaselli 1999b) . Later in his study,  
Tomaselli refers to the idea that the Bushmen capitalise on these stereotypical images of  
themselves and exchange them for cash income. To this effect, 'living museums' which remind  
one of American-style theme parks are constructed for the benefit of the tourists who have  
travelled far to witness 'authentic' Bushman life. In the same way that the West has  
constructed certain images of the Bushmen, so have the Bushmen done of the Westerners.  
Tomaselli illustrates that they do not distinguish between the different westerners who they  
come into contact with.

All these social practices are reduced by the Ju/'hoansi into the text of the Western  
Same, the people who have power and money, and whose largesse has made them  
dependent upon such tourists in terms of cash exchange, development projects and  
inter- village transport (Tomaselli 1999b).

The scenario at Kagga Kamma is a little different because there is an effort made to  
construct the Bushmen as real people, free agents who are attempting to make a living on  
the reserve. On arriving at Kagga Kamma when the receptionist was asked about the

and the Bushmen, she was very careful to establish that  
independently of the reserve.<sup>3</sup> But comments by an  
Argentinian tourist, after meeting the Bushmen, that they possess an untainted  
innocence, indicate that essentialist stereotypes do persist.

---

In terms of the encounter with the Bushmen at Kagga Kamma, I think it important to  
qualify my experience which would affect any of the interpretations made in this analysis.

During discussions on the drive to the reserve, it became obvious that one of the main  
concerns to be investigated was that of the link or the distinction between what  
(Tomaselli 1999c: 202) refers to as 'front stage' where performances are put on for  
tourists and 'back stage' where the Bushmen conduct their private lives. Another related  
concern was that of the possibility of romantic images and historical re-enactments being  
'necessarily advertised and sold in a naturalizing way' (Tomaselli 1999c: 203). As a  
white, idealist student, I also harboured notions which conflicted with my academic  
education of secret romantic longing for the discovery of some sort of essential, primitive  
Man. There were three moments that were vital to the formation of my own subjectivity  
with regards to the Bushmen. The first was my actual meeting face-to-face with the  
Bushmen. It made no difference to my appreciation of the encounter that they had  
assimilated elements of so-called modern life or that they felt the need (and in fact, had the

---

<sup>3</sup> Kagga Kamma is portrayed in a pejorative light by many critics such as Paul Weinberg. In his work,  
there is no recognition of the attempt of management to portray the Bushmen in a more realistic fashion and to  
give them a sense of independence. He states that the owner of the reserve, 'turned out to be more of a  
businessman than a philanthropist; according to Kruiper, he exploited them for a long time, renting them out as  
film actors' (Weinberg 1997: 21). This also contradicts the impression that Jacobs gives that he protects their  
rights from the outside film-makers.

al in a rapidly changing, globalising, modernizing world. The Bushmen and hoist onto them my own notions of identity. The guilt at South Africa's colonial and apartheid past seemed totally inadequate, especially on hearing Danie Jacobs's lecture. This lecture constituted the second moment. Jacobs's emphasis not only on the beauty and the complexity of their culture, but their right to move with the times, influenced my perceptions both of myself, the Bushmen and Kagga Kamma. The third important moment in the formation of my own consciousness in relation to the Bushmen was the interview with Heinrich de Waal, the Manager of Kagga Kamma. His responses seemed to indicate a sense from the owners of Kagga Kamma, who were originally sheep framers, of not having been especially well prepared for the extent of media publicity and criticism and the tourist attention that the family would attract. Affairs operated very much on a trial and error basis, where the owners learnt from their mistakes. For example, Kagga Kamma received negative publicity about the Bushmen visiting Cape Town in their traditional attire. This therefore was discontinued, although the Kruipers themselves still chose to wear some of their natural attire underneath their western clothes. On the basis of these three moments, my identity in relation to the Bushmen was moulded.

The identity of the Bushmen of Southern Africa is a good illustration of the disparity that exists between the concept of a single, insular cultural identity (which corresponds with the popular myths about Bushmen) and one that is contaminated and incomplete. On examining the production of identity in relation to logics of temporality and spatiality, language, narratives of the body, discursive practices of representation and intercultural exchange, within the framework of cultural tourism, it is evident that a model of identity which represents the notion of process is appropriate to the Bushmen. The discussions particularly of language, land and narratives of the body revealed a particularly complex situation in terms of identity formation in the context of South Africa and its divided past. In terms of the Kruiper family, it is obvious that they are implicated in an elaborate process of identity formation especially in the context of South Africa's rapidly changing political, social, cultural and economic environment. This interplay of different identity in its constantly changing form is particularly evident when analysed in

---

---

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

---

- Abercrombie,  
Hill & Turner 1984, 1988. *The Penguin Dictionary of Sociology*. Second Edition. England: Penguin Books.
- Anderson, B. 1983. *Imagined Communities*. London: Verso.
- Bhabha, H. K. 1996. "Culture(s) in-between." In Hall and Du Gray (Eds.) *Questions of cultural identity*. London: Sage Publishers.
- Bruner, E. M. *Between Tourism and Ethnography: A Postmodern Tour Guide in Bali*. University of Illinois.
- Chapman, M. 1997. "South Africa in the global neighbourhood: Towards a method of cultural analysis." *Critical Arts: A Journal of Cultural Studies* 11\1&2. Durban: University of Natal.
- Crawhall, N. 1998. "Still invisible San & Khoe in the New S.A." *Southern Africa Report* May. Np.
- Derrida, J.
- Donald, J. 1996. "The citizen and the man about town." In Hall and Du Gray (Eds.) *Questions of cultural identity*. London: Sage Publishers.
- 
- Forgacs, D. 1993. "National-Popular: Genealogy of a concept." In S. During (Ed.) *The cultural studies reader*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Foucault, M
- Grossberg, L. 1996. "Identity and cultural studies- Is that all there is?" In Hall and Du Gray (Eds.) *Questions of cultural identity*. London: Sage Publishers.
- Hall, S. 1996. "Race, culture, and communications: looking backward and forward at cultural studies." *What is Cultural Studies?* Great Britain: Arnold.
-

- Hall, S. 1990. "Who needs 'Identity'?" In Hall and Du Gray (Eds.) *Representations of cultural identity*. London: Sage Publishers.
- Hall, S. 1990. "The question of cultural identity." *Polity*.
- Jeursen, B. Nd, circa 1998. *Cultural Tourism in Eastern Bushmanland: Notes on a Fieldtrip*.
- Kandjii, K. 1996. *Report on Research Trip to Eastern Bushmanland*. Centre for Cultural and Media Studies.
- Kenny, P. 1989. "Bushmen soldiers' sad march to extinction." 4 June. *Sunday Times*.
- Munnik, V. 1992. "Bushmen in the Fynbos." *New Ground* 9. Np.
- Robins, S. 1998. "Silence in my father's house: memory, nationalism, and narratives of the body." In Nuttall, S. & Coetzee (Eds.) *Negotiating the past: The making of memory in south Africa*. Southern Africa: Oxford University Press.
- Scannell, P. & Cardiff, D. 1995. "The national culture." In Boyd-Barrett & Newbold. *Approaches to media: A reader*. London: Arnold.
- Teer-Tomaselli, R. 1997. "Shifting spaces: Popular culture and national culture." *Critical Arts: A Journal of Cultural Studies* 11\1&2. Durban: University of Natal.
- Tomaselli, K.G. 1995b. "Introduction: Media Recuperations of the San." *Critical Arts : A Journal of Cultural Studies* 9\ 2. The Natal Witness Printing and Publishing (Pty) Ltd.
- Tomaselli, K.G. 1999a. "Encounters in the Kalahari." Theme editor, *Visual Anthropology*, 11-12. Whole issue.
- Tomaselli, K. G. 1999c. *Psychospiritual Ecoscience: The Ju\hoansi, Cultural Tourism and Alchemy*, *Visual Anthropology*, 11-12, 185-195
- Tomaselli, K.G. 1999. "Textualizing the San 'Past': Dancing with Development." *Visual Anthropology*, 11-12, 197-212
- 
- Weinberg, P. 1997. *In Search of the San*. Johannesburg: The Porcupine Press.
- West, C. 1993. "The new cultural politics of difference." In S.



Your complimentary  
use period has ended.  
Thank you for using  
PDF Complete.

[Click Here to upgrade to  
Unlimited Pages and Expanded Features](#)

g (Ed.) *The cultural studies reader*. London and New  
Routledge.

öWaiting for a slice of heaven on earth.ö 17 March.

Witness.

---

---



*Your complimentary  
use period has ended.  
Thank you for using  
PDF Complete.*

[Click Here to upgrade to  
Unlimited Pages and Expanded Features](#)

---

---

---